TRANSFERRING WRITING SKILLS FROM THE MOTHER TONGUE TO THE NATIONAL LANGUAGE:

A CASE STUDY OF PRIMARY GRADE PATANI MALAY STUDENTS IN SOUTHERN THAILAND

5th International Conference on Language and Education: Sustainable Development Through Multilingual Education
19-21 October 2016          Bangkok, Thailand

MIRINDA BURARUNGRUHOT
Research goal

To study the effectiveness of writing skill transfer between the Mother Tongue (L1) and the national language (L2) in the Patani Malay - Thai MTB-MLE project

Objectives

To study the characteristics of writing skill transfer from L1 (Patani Malay) to L2 (Thai) in the MTB-MLE schools in the Southernmost provinces of Thailand

To compare teaching methodologies relating to language and writing in MTB-MLE schools and monolingual Thai comparison schools

To compare the Thai writing abilities of Patani Malay students in MTB-MLE schools and in monolingual Thai schools
Target group

- 4 schools: 2 MTB-MLE schools and 2 comparison schools in Pattani and Narathiwat Provinces

  - **Grade 1: 101 students** (54 MLE students and 47 Comparison students)
  
  - **Grade 3: 97 students** (51 MLE students and 46 Comparison students)
Methodology

- Classroom observation
- Writing skills tests (grades 1 and 3) scored using a customized rubric and analyzed using standard statistical methods.
1st Grade Writing Test Form

- **Part 1:** Letter dictation (consonant and vowel)
- **Part 2:** Complete a word by filling in the initial consonant
- **Part 3:** Order the words in a sentence
- **Part 4:** Write a word from the picture
- **Part 5:** Make a sentence from a stimulus word

All letters and words based on the Thai MOE wordlist for Gr.1 and the lesson plans from both schools.
## Part 1: Letter dictation (consonant & vowel)

Number of students who can write the letters

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School program</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All Consonants &amp; Vowels correct</td>
<td>+C / +V</td>
<td>+C / -V</td>
<td>-C / +V</td>
<td>-C / -V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COMPARISON (47)</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MLE (54)</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Comparison schools vs. MLE/Experimental schools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Part 1: Letter (Consonant &amp; Vowel)</th>
<th>Comparison schools</th>
<th>MLE/Experimental schools</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>58.11</td>
<td>89.12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Part 1: Letter dictation (consonant & vowel)
Number of students who can write the letters

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School program</th>
<th>All Consonants &amp; Vowels correct</th>
<th>All Consonants correct but not all Vowels</th>
<th>All Vowels correct but not all Consonants</th>
<th>Errors in both Consonants &amp; Vowels</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>+C / +V</td>
<td>+C / -V</td>
<td>-C / +V</td>
<td>-C / -V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COMPARISON (47)</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MLE (54)</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

COMP

MLE
Part 4: Write a word from a picture

Recognizing a word from a picture and correctly spelling it. (CVC & Tone)
**Part 4: Write a word from a picture**

Recognizing a word from a picture and correctly spelling it. (CVC & Tone)
### Part 5: Write a sentence from a stimulus word (no picture)

#### Student results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School program</th>
<th>1 Full Sentence with SVO</th>
<th>2 Phrase VP/ NP only</th>
<th>3 Word only</th>
<th>4 Letter only</th>
<th>5 Nothing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>COMPARISON</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MLE</td>
<td>24*</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### MLE vs. Comparison

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>MLE (54)</th>
<th>Comparison (47)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Part 5: Sentence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Example Sentences

1. Crab /ˈkræb/  
2. Egg /ˈeɡ/  
3. Sea /ˈseɪ/  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Comparison schools</th>
<th>MLE/Experimental schools</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Part 5: Sentence</td>
<td>18.74</td>
<td>37.91</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Part 5: Write a sentence from a stimulus word (no picture)

Student results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School program</th>
<th>1: Full Sentence with SVO</th>
<th>2: Phrase VP/ NP only</th>
<th>3: Word only</th>
<th>4: Letter only</th>
<th>5: Nothing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>COMPARISON</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MLE</td>
<td>24*</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

COMP:
- None 34%
- Letter 30%
- VP/ NP 0%
- SVO 28%

MLE:
- Word 7%
- VP/ NP 43%
- Letter 0%
- None 7%
- SVO 43%
Part 5: Full sentence writing in Grade 1

**MLE students**

- **SVO (with no elaboration)**
  - ผมกินไข่
  - ‘I eat an egg’
  - ผมไปทะเล
  - ‘I go to the sea’

- **SVO (Adj.)**
  - ผมกินปูตัวใหญ่
  - ‘I eat a big crab’
  - ผมมีปูตัวเล็ก
  - ‘I have a little crab’

- **SVO (Num./+Cl.)**
  - ผมมีไข่ 1 ฟอง
  - ‘I have 1 egg’
  - ฉันมีปู 3 ตัว
  - ‘I have 3 crabs’

- **SVO (Prep.)**
  - ผมเล่นกับปู
  - ‘I play with a crab’
  - มีไข่อยู่ที่นา
  - ‘There is an egg in the rice field’

**COMP students**

- **SVO (with no elaboration)**
  - ฉันกินไข่
  - ‘I eat an egg’
  - ผมไปทะเล
  - ‘I go to the sea’

- **SVO (with no elaboration)**
  - ฉันกินไข่
  - ‘I eat an egg’
  - ผมไปทะเล
  - ‘I go to the sea’

- **SVO (Adj.)**
  - ฉันกินปูตัวใหญ่
  - ‘I eat a big crab’
  - ฉันมีปูตัวเล็ก
  - ‘I have a little crab’

- **SVO (with no elaboration)**
  - ฉันไปทะเลกับพ่อแม่
  - ‘I go to the sea with my parents’
  - มีไข่อยู่ที่นา
  - ‘There is an egg in the rice field’
3rd Grade Writing Test

- **Testing:** 2 times (1st and 2nd semester)
- **Test form:** Writing about an assigned topic
- **Testing rubric**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A. Assess Language Features</th>
<th>B. Assess the Content Structure</th>
<th>C. Assess Cognitive Features</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sentence, Words, Spelling &amp; Handwriting, Punctuation</td>
<td>Orientation, Plot, Character, Closure</td>
<td>Organized, Make sense, Reflective comment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

"What I Want to be When I Grow Up"
The MLE students scored higher on all 3 parts in the first and second semesters. Stars show statistically significant differences.
3rd Grade Writing Test
Part B: Content structural feature

The 1st Thai Writing Test in Grade 3
Part B: Content Structural feature

The 2nd Thai Writing Test in Grade 3
Part B: Content structural feature

Testing Skill in part B: Content features

Comparison
MTB MLE

Testing skill in part B: Content structural features

Comparison
MTB MLE
3rd Grade Writing Test
Part C: Cognitive feature

The 1st Thai writing test in grade 3
Part C: Cognitive feature

- C1.Organisation: 52.23
- C2.Make Sense: 53.33
- Total C: 42.11

The 2nd Thai writing test in grade 3
Part C: Cognitive feature

- C1.Organisation: 44.43
- C2.Make Sense: 47.63
- C3.Refl. Comment: 17.3
- Total C: 39.3

Comparison vs. MTB MLE
Highest scoring papers (Grade 3)

MTB MLE student

Comparison student

Code: Gr3:T1_E1:F12

Code: Gr3:T1_C2:M11
Story from MTB-MLE student:

- I wake up in the morning, wash my face, brush my teeth, and make my bed. Then I quickly take a bath, have breakfast, and let my father take me to school. When I arrive at the school, I clean my area in the classroom. At noon, I have lunch and buy some snacks to eat. When I finish eating, I go to pray. Then, in the afternoon, I have classes. The classes are Art, Arabic language, and remedial courses in Thai language and mathematics. When the classes finish, my friends often go to the bathroom and then pray. Then we line up to go back home.

- At home, I change clothes from the school uniform, help my mother wash the dishes, then go to play. When I finish playing, I take a bath and go to study the Koran (evening class beside mosque) and to pray. Then I go back home, change clothes to pajamas, and watch a TV program. Then, I go to bed at 22:00.

- Each day, I like to play because playing makes me happy, is enjoyable, and is not stressful. It is exercise that makes me healthy and gives me a strong body.
Story:

One day in the morning, I take a bath, brush my teeth and have breakfast with my parents. Then I go to school, I like to play with my friends because it's healthy. Then, I go to read the book in the classroom.

Then I go back home for play with my friends. Then at 6 pm, I go to learn Al-koran. Then, at 8 pm, I take a bath and brush my teeth and have dinner. Then see the TV program the 'L' soap opera. Then I go to bed.

I am happy today. I like to play football because the body will be strong.
Characteristics of writing skill transfer from L1 to L2 for the MLE students.

- Letter recognition skills transfer (same phonemes, shape, and hand movement)
- Word building skills transfer (same consonant and vowel positioning)
- Sentence building skills transfer (same word ordering in sentence level)
Conclusions

1. The PM data provide clear evidence that literacy skills—including writing—gained in L1 transfer readily to L2.

2. The PM data provide clear evidence that initial literacy in L1 facilitates quicker and more efficient access to literacy skills in L2 despite reduced instructional attention to the development of L2 literacy skills.

3. The PM data provide evidence that initial educational success in L1 mediates enhanced mastery of L2 in the earlier grades.

4. The PM data provide evidence of heightened educational efficiencies with respect to the amount of time required to learn a fixed set of skills.

5. The PM data provide evidence that some aspects of skill development in writing develop more slowly than others.
Thank you

- Prof. Emeritus Dr. Suwila i Premsrirat
- Prof. Dr. Siripen Ungsittipoonponm
- Dr. Susan Malone
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Stephen Walter
- Asst. Prof. Dr. Kirk Person